





## Extending the leisure substitutability concept

Justin Harmon<sup>a</sup> and Kyle Woosnam<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Department of Community and Therapeutic Recreation, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, Greensboro, NC, USA; <sup>b</sup>Warnell School of Forestry and Natural Resources, University of Georgia, Athens, GA, USA

### ABSTRACT

Leisure commitment has been studied for several decades now, but few attempts have been made to look at how leisurists benefit from participation in one activity when it comes to selecting another, but related, activity. The concept of leisure substitutability has been helpful in understanding what is entailed in switching activities, but does not address an important issue: how one leisure activity can potentially set up or introduce other leisure activities. The current work seeks to build on the leisure substitutability concept by showcasing the importance of past experience in making future leisure choices. The existence of a high level of participation in a leisure activity can create a space for the development of knowledge, skills or interests which may lead to a more fulfilling activity that better suits the individual's life circumstances at that particular point in time, and may provide justification for abandonment or lessening of the former activity or affiliation.

### ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 19 April 2016

Accepted 8 September 2016

### KEYWORDS

Leisure; substitutability; music

## Introduction

An abundance of research has focused on the various forms of leisure commitment over the last several decades, specifically serious leisure, enduring involvement and recreation specialization. These concepts have been instrumental in examining how participants become involved in leisure activities (Baldwin and Norris 1999; Beaumont and Brown 2015), how their level of participation develops (Ditton, Loomis, and Choi 1992; Broström 2016), how an individual modifies their leisure behaviour (Lamont, Kennelly, and Moyle 2014), and in some cases, how participation is discontinued (Kuentzel and Heberlein 2006). While the concluding comments of most discussion sections state the need for additional research into understanding how people progress through their leisure careers, further thought needs to be given to the impetus behind why people choose to exit an activity or decrease their level of participation, and how they can capitalize on their time and efforts while being involved in the former activity. Leisure activities which are of significance to one's life are typically thought to be composed of three core facets: attraction, centrality and self-expression (McIntyre and Pigram 1992; Stebbins 2014). Attraction is commonly understood as the importance and pleasure derived from participation. The centrality of an activity is related to the level of priority it takes in

one's life. Finally, self-expression is derived from the representational qualities of participation an individual wishes to project to others about their involvement (Kyle and Chick 2004). For the purposes of this manuscript, leisure activities are defined as freely chosen outlets that comprise the aforementioned qualities.

The purpose of this study was to investigate how music fans developed their musical and social preferences through their lengthy participation in specific music scenes which led to involvement in subculturally related music scenes. Through this personal development, fans were able to refine what it was they sought through their involvement in terms of enjoyment and meaning through music (DeNora 2000). Additionally, fans were able to find like-minded others who had similar life experiences and interests that strengthened the foundation of social relationships that led to the development of close-knit communities (Harmon and Kyle 2016; Dunlap 2009).

We used Hendee and Burdge's (1974) concept of substitutability to reach an understanding of these phenomena of substitutability in music fan communities, though we found it necessary to extend the construct's original delineation. Hendee and Burdge defined the concept as 'An interchangeability among activities in satisfying participants' motives, needs and preferences' (157). Where the concept of leisure substitutability is lacking is that it does not take into consideration the educational and personal planning components of leisure participation and commitment, and is largely based on the foundation of a scarcity of resources; in effect the intrinsic element is negated by external factors. Furthermore, the substitutability literature does not address the potential for an individual's lack of conviction to maintain participation, or their evolution of interests, which may cause the desire to switch to another related activity. What is not fully understood is how people capitalize on their past leisure experiences to make future leisure decisions that are more fitting of their leisure goals and desires. It is our purpose in this paper to build on the leisure substitutability concept to explore and explain these ideas through fan participation in the music scene of the band Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons.

## Review of literature

### *Finding community*

When we consider the concepts of commitment and belonging, and their role in participating in meaningful leisure, an adequate and relevant idea to explore is the construct of community. Individuals' involvement in meaningful leisure allows for the building of friendship networks that aid the process of identity building and maintenance (Arai and Pedlar 1997). When individuals feel they enact their agency through the construction of intimate, reciprocal relationships with others, it often leads to a sense of solidarity that strengthens the bonds between members (Hollinger 2006). While relationships typically require overcoming differences and navigating personalities to grow and sustain, feeling a part of a community lends to the desire to make compromises that result in mutual benefit for all involved (Creed 2006).

Some scholars (Glover and Stewart 2006), however, remind us that we must acknowledge that what is often viewed as solidarity in community relationships from one perspective must also be seen for its potential to be divisive from the perspective of outsiders, or those casually involved in the community. While this potential for division can be a

legitimate concern, when the members of a community are united through a valuable, central object, such as a band and its music, the personal growth, attraction and mutual-fulfilment are emphasized for the benefit of the community (Pedlar and Haworth 2006). This perspective is commonly referred to as 'communitarian', where leisure brings people together around shared meanings to remove the structures that cause division and create a space for people to come together in fellowship (Arai and Pedlar 2003).

### ***Well-being and quality of life***

Subjective well-being is derived through an individuals' assessment of their life as a whole with leisure and the *valued* use of free-time playing an intimate role (Diener, Oishi, and Lucas 2011). It has been stated that the objective measure of an individuals' leisure participation, such as attending concerts with close friends, is one of the best predictors of a high quality of life (Lloyd and Auld 2002). Music, specifically, has been shown to significantly add to listeners' quality of life by serving as a source of personal authenticity (Ruud 1997). Ruud said that through the discovery of meaningful music fans develop a 'narrative of their identity into alignment with a feeling of what life should be like' (93). Music promotes 'self-interpretation' and an 'assessment of self-image' which results in a feeling of continuity and a reflexive form of personal-therapy for navigating life's ebbs and flows (Laiho 2004, 54). Music is also a valuable means for communicating identities and interests with others (Lewis 1983). Camfield and Skevington (2008) stated that developing social relationships and building communities through shared interests is a vital component of maintaining a high quality of life. Music, then, serves as a medium through which people can connect with their personal history through rediscovery and redefinition of past experiences for future benefit (Creech et al. 2013; Perkins and Williamson 2014).

### ***Broaden-and-build theory***

Fredrickson (2001), a pioneering figure in positive psychology, said that 'positive meanings can trigger positive emotions' that result in broadened awareness and thought that increases the 'likelihood of finding positive meaning in subsequent events' (223). Fredrickson (1998) stated that while positive emotions are ephemeral, 'they facilitate learning and mastery' (311). Drawing from the broaden-and-build theory helps to set up vital components of the expansion of the leisure substitutability concept; namely that through individuals' leisure careers they develop an understanding of themselves through the activity and therefore when a change in goals or desired outcomes is presented, such as the pursuit of a more fulfilling musical or social experience, they seek to *build* off the aspects that have been most important to them through their participation in selecting another activity, most likely one that retains much of what they found appealing. Leisure providers, then, must understand not only the elements of the activities they offer that are most appealing or rewarding to their clientele, but must anticipate the trajectories of their patrons to craft the most logical and rewarding programmes and activities for future leisure pursuits and individual leisure evolution, thus *broadening* offerings and patrons' leisure horizons and *building* on past successes of the organization and the consumer.

## *Leisure substitutability*

The earliest work on substitutability generally followed the framework of Hendee and Burdge (1974). They defined the concept as 'An interchangeability among activities in satisfying participants' motives, needs and preferences' (157). Later, Iso-Ahola (1986) developed the concept into a more concrete theory of substitutability. He defined his basic principle as:

Substitution means that the originally intended or desired behavior is no longer possible and must therefore be replaced by another behavior if leisure involvement is to be initiated or continued. (369)

For Iso-Ahola (1986), his principle addresses leisure participation that has 'been blocked or is threatened to be blocked by factors external to the individual' (369). In reality, there are not always overriding external constraints; the decision to switch from one activity to another is often intrinsic and initiated by the desire for greater satisfaction or more beneficial outcomes. However, external variables such as reduced physical ability or newfound family/career obligations *could* play a role in necessitating a change. Two key aspects of Iso-Ahola's theory which need to be revisited are, one, that his conceptualization does not consider the 'decisions made in the planning stage of participation' (383). Understanding that the conscious pursuit of future involvement may include the evolution of leisure participation must be accepted. Secondly, his theory requires that decisions are made due to leisure resources being 'limited and scarce' (384), again, discounting the importance of the intrinsic elements of personal leisure growth.

Brunson and Shelby (1993) found that the research on substitutability was too 'restrictive' based on Hendee and Burdge's (1974) original delineation. They suggested a broader definition:

The term recreation substitutability refers to the interchangeability of recreation experiences such that acceptably equivalent outcomes can be achieved by varying one or more of the following: the timing of the experience, the means of gaining access, the setting, and the activity. (69)

While the updated definition includes the 'interchangeability of recreation experiences' with 'equivalent outcomes', still at the core of this concept are overriding external constraints. To reiterate, it is not always the case that there are external constraints that prevent leisure participation. Instead, the decision to switch activities are often of the leisurists' own volition to pursue some activity that is more encompassing of desired goals, needs or outcomes; something that may not have been met in prior participation in a related activity, perhaps due to a lack of knowledge, awareness, or of changing goals. Additionally, better outcomes should be sought, not 'equivalent' ones. Personal growth through leisure does not suggest complacency or stagnation, it suggests the betterment of the individual in a myriad of ways such as health, happiness and outlook. Also of note is Brunson and Shelby's (1993) statement that their revised concept of substitutability 'does not address the underlying question of how "acceptable equivalence" is determined' (70). To understand what are 'acceptable equivalents' providers must understand the multiple aspects of leisurists' interests, motivations and experiences with an activity, and most importantly, which are the elements that must be retained in order to offer more desirable alternatives. This idea necessitates that assessments must dissect experiences and

trajectories to ascertain what are the core aspects integral to approaching continuity in the face of switching activities, and thus, for providers, leading to customer retention.

Jackson and Dunn (1988) developed a model to conceptualize the process of ceasing leisure participation which involved four groups: continuers, switchers, quitters, and of most relevance to this manuscript, replacers. While the authors' intention was to illustrate how leisure participants transition out of activities, and in some cases, into others, the concept did not seek to elaborate how this was done beyond the mere structure of possibilities. Searle (1991) expanded on this construct by delineating replacers into three sub-categories: those that stayed in the same activity but switched providers; those that replaced the activity but stayed with the same provider; and those that replaced both the activity and the provider. Searle said that those who quit and pursue a new leisure activity may do so because the goals they previously sought had changed. In this scenario, it is also possible that the provider may have failed to be proactive in anticipating those changing needs or goals of the customer. Clearly, the objective of leisure providers is not to lose clientele, so in order to prevent attrition it is imperative to be conscious of users' needs, motivations and goals, but also to be aware of trends in the industry that might suggest an evolution in leisure activity trajectories. While it is important for leisure providers to stay on the cutting edge in terms of activity provision, they must also understand and embrace the possibility that these trajectories are not always linear. As Ditton and Sutton (2004) indicated, if a replacement activity does not 'provide the same benefits as the original, it is a complement or an alternative, not a substitute' (89). It may therefore be best to expand the concept of leisure substitutability along the lines of the pursuit of complementary activities. First, we need to consider the existence of previous involvement in a leisure activity that is related to the one someone plans to pursue in the future. Second, the new activity must be more attractive or appealing to the participant to stimulate the desire to switch. Third, the former activity may have provided knowledge, interests or skills that spurred participant involvement to high levels which resulted in the desire to maintain equally high levels of participation in the new activity. It is not simply substituting one activity for another; it is a conscious pursuit of other opportunities with a perceived result of greater satisfaction from switching participation or allegiance. While an individual does not need to abandon the former activity *per se*, their level of involvement will be greatly reduced by the mere necessity of allocating time, resources and energy in the newfound affiliation. A complementary activity, in this case, is one that provides *better* outcomes based off of a participants' growth through another related activity, thus capitalizing on past leisure experiences.

While Jackson and Dunn (1988) listed 'quitters' as one of their modes of ceasing participation, it was very elementary in its development. To build on this, Robert Stebbins (2008) explored the idea of leisure abandonment which he defined as the point in a person's life where they choose to leave a particular activity. He developed his concept with 5 types of abandonment that included 13 antecedent conditions, one of which is particularly germane to this study. The first type, volitional leisure abandonment, contained the antecedent 'participant retains interest, but an even more appealing activity comes along, leading the person to abandon the first one' (15). This precursor to abandonment aligns well with the substitutability concept in that the activity maintains some level of attraction, perhaps due to the amount of time invested or number of friendships made while participating. For Stebbins (2008), however, leisure abandonment necessarily implies the

potential for a 'personal crisis'. Furthermore, he states that the focus of leisure abandonment is on 'what is wrong' with an activity (14). The decision to substitute an activity does not imply that there is inherently something wrong with an activity or that participants have reached a stage of 'crisis', but that there exists a potentially more fulfilling activity to take its place. It would be like saying something was 'wrong' with high school because college provided a more diverse experience, or that something was 'wrong' with a long-distance runner's time on their first marathon because their time on the tenth marathon was much faster. Substitutability should seek to explain the evolution of leisure careers which requires a historical context of involvement, improvement, growth and personal education.

### ***Extending 'leisure substitutability'***

Schmidt and Stein (1991) indicated that those who drop out of an activity 'can elect to switch to an activity that is equally or more attractive than the current one' (261). However, they did not provide much development beyond this simple adumbration about what is actually entailed in the dropout process. Participants' reasons for ceasing involvement in a leisure activity are surely as varied as the individuals themselves, and it would seem advantageous that the term 'dropout' would benefit from future discussions that include a broader consideration of individuals' motivations to do so. Dropping out of an activity can be as simple as coming to the realization that the activity does not live up to expectations, and it can be as intricate as to involve the social components or relationships formed within the period of participation.

Dropout can also be seen in a more positive light; dropout can lead to a more worthwhile sensation from participation in a related activity. For instance, in Kuentzel and Heberlein's (2006) study of boater progression, owners of power boats and cabin cruisers in the northern part of Wisconsin showed a 40% decrease in boat ownership over the course of a 20-year study. The authors found that leisure participation in this sport was primarily for entertainment as opposed to goal achievement (in that the participants were not trying to become experts), and that the expenses (time, money and access) of ownership negatively impacted the majority of respondents' desire to remain involved. This would be a clear indication of dropout in the broadest sense. What was not examined, however, was whether the respondents moved on to other leisure activities that fall within the same broad genre, such as kayaking or canoeing. A former power boater or cabin cruiser might find that they still have a draw to being on the open water, but they no longer have the income, time or desire to maintain an expensive vessel. Expanding understanding of the leisure substitutability concept will provide a framework for conceptualizing behaviour for researchers and practitioners. In the case, where participants are exiting an activity that was predominately not enjoyable, further development of the substitutability concept might be beneficial to providers in ruling out options that are not likely to suit their participants' leisure preferences. The process of continuous reflection of what is most meaningful to participants in their leisure pursuits would, in effect, be a survival-of-the-fittest of leisure traits to best understand how to effectively use and enjoy one's time in their chosen activities while eliminating the elements that are less desirable.

Through investigations of why it is people choose to leave an activity, we may be able to deduce what aspects of the activity were not adequate, what changes could have been

made to improve these aspects, and how the participant's needs were or were not met elsewhere. In the event that the former activity could not be improved upon for the individual, by establishing what were the core positive components of their involvement coupled with the aspirational qualities that were missing, we may be able to constructively offer other activities that best capture the sum of their needs, desires or goals. By building on participants' past leisure activity commitments, we can make educated decisions on how participants might proceed through their leisure careers in order to garner the best potential for future leisure offerings.

## Methods

### *Research design*

The research question guiding this study was how does past leisure participation lead to future leisure activity selection? The intent of the study was to examine how fan immersion in music scenes provided a context to learn about other forms of music that were more appealing to fans' wants and needs. For this line of inquiry, it was apparent that ethnographic methods would yield the most thorough accounting of the phenomenon at hand (Tracy 2013). As such, a qualitative approach and a research strategy that relied on in-depth, semi-structured interviews was chosen. Due to the differentiated and personal aspect of each fans' past and current involvement, we deemed this approach to be the most productive in terms of understanding how participants' life histories with music unfolded and linked participation in one music scene to another.

### *Interviews*

Thirty-four informants participated in semi-structured interviews. The fans of the band Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons are small in terms of total numbers, but dedicated in terms of frequency of involvement. Rarely more than a few hundred fans attend Jackmormons' shows; in some cases small crowds of 20 or 30 are present. Participants stated numerous times that roughly '100 core people' can be expected to be at the largest events each year. The participants were selected through the aid of influential people involved in the music scene. The fans that fit this designation were those who had a high level of involvement in the music scene based on their longevity and frequency of participation with the band. The average participant had been seeing the band for at least a decade and most averaged a minimum of 10 shows a year. These initial contacts were chosen through purposive sampling (Patton 1990) developed from first-hand knowledge through the long-established involvement in the music scene of the first author, and further participants were contacted through suggestions received from already established participants using a snowball sampling technique (Tracy 2013). The majority of interviews were conducted the day of a concert at or near the venue (25), though others (9) were conducted either the week before or week after a concert (typically at fans' homes). All interviews were recorded with permission and typically lasted for one hour, though several spanned approximately three hours. All interviewees were assigned pseudonyms to provide confidentiality, but based on certain responses or fan roles, pseudonymous identities may be apparent to other fans. The participants were both male and



female, and ranged in age from their late-20s to their late-50s at time of interview, with an average age of 42. The interviewees predominately resided in the western United States; mostly in Colorado or Oregon. The study was conducted between December of 2012 and August of 2014. At the time of the interviews, the participants had seen anywhere from 25 to 250 shows in their tenure as fans.

### ***Analysis of data***

Charmaz' (2006) grounded theory approach was adopted for analysis in this research. Such an approach involved an inductive understanding of the uniqueness of each participant's meaning and understanding of their involvement. Interview transcripts were read through, highlighting anything related to participants' historical relationship with music, specifically in regards to extended or intricate involvement with other bands. Similarities amongst participants' responses were coded to see if patterns emerged in terms of how fans became involved in various music scenes, how their level of involvement developed, and what were the mitigating factors leading to their decisions to cease participation in one music subculture and become immersed in another. The data were managed with a physical organization system that included establishing a hierarchy of each quote as it pertained to the research question (Saldaña 2012). This method was effective in establishing the importance of past involvement for future leisure choices. Some of the questions we asked that led to the material in our results section were: What were you primarily listening to at the time you first heard of Jerry Joseph? Did the music of Jerry Joseph displace your listening to any other artist? How would you describe your past involvement with other bands? What are the major differences between your past music group affiliations and that of Jerry Joseph? In what ways have your current involvement with the Jackmormons' scene affected your life in a positive manner?

## **Results**

### ***Filling the gap in music scene participation***

While speaking with Kevin about his past as a Deadhead,<sup>1</sup> he mentioned that for several years there was no music he played other than the Grateful Dead. He said that after Jerry Garcia<sup>2</sup> died, 'I never thought I would attach emotionally to another band. That was very hard for that to stop.' Between the years 1995 and 2001, Kevin did not have a band to which he felt deeply connected. In 2001 he saw the Jackmormons for the first time in Colorado, and after that concert, he decided to see the remainder of the band's tour in that state (seven more shows). In responding to what it was that was so special about that first show, Kevin said, 'I found an absolute new passion that I never thought would exist after the Grateful Dead. It clicked. It was just meant to be from there on out.' He said that when he left that first Jackmormons' concert, 'I knew it was a winner immediately. I knew that was my new favorite band.'

Another fan who was deeply immersed in the music scene surrounding the Grateful Dead, Kim, said that her participation in that subculture allowed her to gain experiences she would not have been able to otherwise. In addition to travelling the country, the friendships she made began to resemble the closeness of family. When the Dead

disbanded in 1995, she felt she was lacking the community sensation and deep attraction to music she formerly possessed. It was not until almost 5 years later that she discovered the music of Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons which she described as a 'gift'. She said that 'every song has true meaning' and is applicable to her life. Kim said that she learned a lot from her experiences participating in the tours of the Grateful Dead, following them around the country from venue to venue, but now she has found something that truly speaks to her sense of self and fully encapsulates what it is she is looking for in music – honest, heartfelt rock n' roll with real meaning and close friends to share it with.

### ***Music scene participation as a conduit to future benefit***

Several other fans had a connection to the Grateful Dead, but due to the length of time since the band last played, most had come to associate themselves more recently with the band Widespread Panic (WP) in the years following the Dead's dissolution. Tom, who had seen WP dozens of times before he saw the Jackmormons, first saw Jerry Joseph perform on stage with WP in 2002 and said that, 'the second I heard Jerry, it was over. The second I heard him'. When asked to expand on what he meant by that statement, he said that Jerry's sound was more to his liking, and was more emotionally expressive with deeper lyrics and more of a hard rock sound. He became more involved with attending Jackmormons' concerts, and when asked about his affiliation with WP, he said, 'It's not really my scene anymore. I miss Panic, I'll go see them, but I'm pretty devoted, pretty loyal to the Jackmormons.' He said the feeling that he used to have for WP had waned, and that the emotional connection had shifted to the Jackmormons, and has increased in terms of association and meaning in his life. He was openly thankful about the years he spent seeing the band WP perform live, and when questioned about their role in turning him on to his 'favourite band', he felt as if he owed WP a debt of gratitude.

Susanne was heavily involved in seeing both the Dead and WP in the early 1990s, but felt more connected to WP. She said that, 'the music of WP just stopped me. I was in love with the band'. She first saw the Jackmormons in 1997 at a late-show following WP, and said of that first experience,

Oh my god, it was awesome. I was impressed with the energy. I finally found someone playing this hard music that I was looking for but didn't know I was looking for. When I saw him (Jerry Joseph), I was like: this is exactly the kind of music I like.

She maintained her association and 'love' of WP for several years, but by 2005 Jerry Joseph's music had started to displace the music of WP. Jerry Joseph was now her 'go to' music. We asked her why the 'love' she felt for WP faded, to which she responded, 'I found my happy place with the Jackmormons. This is what I enjoy.' In addition, she said that she had crafted some of her closest friends in the music scene surrounding the Jackmormons which further led her to feel as if she were 'home' when in their presence at concerts.

Dave, who felt he was lucky to catch the end of the Grateful Dead, said that they turned him onto a whole new world of music and culture he had never experienced before. He said that, 'The end of the road isn't the Dead; there's a whole new horizon.' He became an avid follower of WP for several years until 2002 when one of the founding members died. WP stayed together, but Dave felt they lost the magic with the passing of their lead guitarist. He said that he was torn between staying with WP which had been his

'whole life and self-identity for the last 7–8 years' and letting go of this significant affiliation because it had become a shell of its former self. Though he had seen Jerry Joseph years earlier, it was about this same time that he saw the Jackmormons again and he said that, 'Maybe this is the beginning of a new chapter. The baton has been passed.' He was 'severing' his relationship with WP and going 'onward and upward' with the Jackmormons. Dave said that in his earliest association with WP he felt through their lyrics as if 'there always seemed to be a story unfolding that somehow applied to my life'. But as he began to drift away from his close connection with WP, and embrace the music of the Jackmormons, Dave found that it was more representative of his newfound association. He said that WP was largely dependent on 'feel-good anthems' and basic lyrical structures. With the music of Jerry Joseph, he found it to be more complex and that 'deeper roots' existed that tied him to the music much more intimately. Dave said that 'Jerry is pretty much always going to let you into his soul' and that allowed him to feel more a part of the musical experience.

### ***The emotion of transition***

Wilson also had similar sentiments with the original era of WP. He too was no longer as connected to the music of WP without their founding member and was looking for something that filled the musical void in his life. When he first heard the Jackmormons, he said their music 'just grabbed me'. He said seeing 'the power' of the band in the live concert setting 'hooked' him immediately, and that he again had a band whose performance and music catalog could take the place of his previous immersion with WP. While he felt he might never have a connection to a guitarist the way he did with Mikey Houser (WP's deceased member), he said that Joseph's guitar work and lyrics 'hit the spot'. He felt he could relate to the lyrical content because it could make you feel a variety of emotions. He said of his new association that the music was 'very therapeutic. It can be an escape to transport you to a different space in your life, and then in some weird way it can help you out'.

Wilson first heard about Jerry Joseph through a friend who he had been involved with the WP scene. Because Jerry Joseph collaborated with WP so frequently, Wilson felt he was lucky to have close friends who could introduce him to music he found so meaningful. Wilson said that music in general was often a 'guide' for navigating his life, but that the music of Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons was especially so. Because of this realization, he felt indebted to his previous involvement with WP and close friends for turning him on to something so special to his life.

Ivan was another participant who previously had multiple long-term tenures with other bands; first Phish, and then WP. His first Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons show was about a week after the passing of WP's lead guitarist (2002). WP had soldiered on and was playing a weekend of shows outside Denver, Colorado. Ivan serendipitously went to an after-show with the Jackmormons because members from WP were to be playing in accompaniment. He found the experience overwhelmingly emotional due to the recent passing of guitarist Mikey Houser, as well because of the spirit and enthusiasm other WP members showed while playing with the Jackmormons. He said of the night, 'It was like the most epic first Jerry show you could have, right? I was pretty much hooked after that. That is about when they became my new favorite band.'

WP has a considerably larger following than that of Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons, and for Ivan, that was significant to his current level of involvement with the band. He said that the scene

becomes a lot more personal. You actually meet people. When there are 20,000 people in attendance, how do you get to make friends? With the Jackmormons, there may be a couple hundred, tops. It's a lot easier to recognize and approach people. The small size allows you to build real relationships.

Because of the close association of WP and Jerry Joseph, and because the majority of participants found the Jackmormons through their previous involvement with WP, this allowed for a shared musical history to extend far beyond any interaction and involvement in the Jackmormons' music scene. When fans eventually met in the smaller subculture, their communal past associations were very beneficial to establishing strong relationships.

Shawn had also been deeply immersed in the WP scene, and while he said it was always fun, for him, it was more about the travel and opportunity to meet new people than the music itself. While he had seen more than 50 WP shows, his involvement was more for the 'vacation experience'. We asked him about his first time seeing the Jackmormons and he said,

I saw a show in Hood River [Oregon, USA] at the River City Saloon and Jerry just crushed it. He just brought the hammer down. It just resonated in me. I got it. I enjoyed Panic, but it never really clicked with me. I'd never had that feeling before [with any other band].

Shawn went on to say that the Jackmormons were the first band 'that got their hook in me. I don't know how to put that into words, but I love them. They're fantastic'. He was grateful for his time with WP, above all, because his involvement in that music scene directly led to finding the music of Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons and the people he has come to call his closest friends.

## Discussion

Whether it was through a previous association with either the Grateful Dead or Widespread Panic, the preceding participant excerpts showcase a close association of fans with a band and its music. Most of the fans interviewed had a significant level of involvement with one band or the other, and at some time had closely identified with their music to the point that it was one of the most meaningful aspects of their lives (Kyle and Chick 2002; Saarikallio and Erkkilä 2007). However, due to the discovery of music that more accurately spoke to their needs and desires, the fans abandoned or lessened their former affiliation to become immersed in the music scene surrounding the Jackmormons. Their previous involvement with either the Dead or WP was integral to their new association in many ways. Most simply the music of WP was a direct conduit to the music of the Jackmormons because of the two bands' close collaborations. More indirectly, the unique subculture that surrounded the Dead and WP created a space for fans to learn about themselves and their likes and dislikes, both musically and culturally, and this led to finding more of what they were looking for with the Jackmormons (Scott and Godbey 1994).

While the living members of the Dead continue to play in various formations, and the surviving members of WP continue to perform in the spirit of their original creation, many fans of these bands significantly decreased, if not all together abandoned, their participation with them because of the unfortunate transition associated with band member

death, or in most cases, the discovery of another band and its music that was more in tune with their preferences. It could be accurately stated that these fans dropped out of their former high level of leisure association because they found something that was more fitting of their interests (Schmidt and Stein 1991).

Because of the culture that surrounds the genre of music the aforementioned bands fall under, the fans we spoke with drew heavily on past involvement to initiate current involvement with a different band. This includes not only seeing the band perform and listening to their music outside the concert setting, but also maintaining, adapting, and growing their personal sense of identity, and establishing and maintaining meaningful relationships with like-minded people, many of who also were deeply immersed in the Dead or WP subcultures (Rentfrow, McDonald, and Oldmeadow 2009). Continuing involvement in a musical subculture was integral to their development and maturation, and allowed for a connection to the past and the continuation of a personal music history (Schäfer and Sedlmeier 2009).

Stebbins (2008) spoke of the concept of 'drift' in that it involves a non-conscious decision to abandon a leisure activity. In some ways, this idea fits some of the participants at their initial stage of transition. Due to their high level of involvement and closely associated identities with either the Dead or WP, many felt that they held on longer to their association than they should have. It was not until they found the music of Jerry Joseph that they began to 'drift' away from their current level of involvement. Some who still maintained a high level of involvement with WP even after the passing of their lead guitarist were eventually introduced to the music of Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons and predominately found the music and the scene that comprised it to be more to their liking for a variety of reasons, mostly due to the intelligence and applicability of the lyrics, power of the music and closeness of relationships they formed in their newfound affiliation (Harmon and Kyle 2016).

Due to the passing of a core member of WP, others immediately felt a loss of connection to the band and music they once loved. For those, Stebbins' (2008) thoughts on drift would not apply. Here, Hendee and Burdge's (1974) definition of substitutability would be more apropos: 'An interchangeability among activities in satisfying participants' motives, needs and preferences' (174). Of course, their definition was crafted with outdoor recreation activities in mind and was intended to serve management needs. In its current state, the concept does not consider how participants build on the importance of past leisure associations to lead to future, more suitable or beneficial leisure associations. This is why we felt the need to expand the concept of leisure substitutability to consider the existence of high levels of participation in leisure activities, which can create a space for the development of knowledge, skills or interests leading to more fulfilling activities that better suit the participant's life circumstances at that particular point in time, and may provide justification for abandonment or lessening of the former activity or affiliation.

## Conclusion

The underlying theme that is relevant to each participant in this study is each fan's individual sense of identity as associated with their total personal history of involvement in the music scenes mentioned above. The initial attraction to the music allowed fans to have positive emotional reactions they interpreted as beneficial to their lives (DeNora 2000; Ruud 1997). In addition, through this personal development of life quality through music scene participation, the participants were able to address issues of identity because of their

close associations with the music, the band and the friends they made through participation (Clay 2003; Davis 2006). Building on their personal life histories with music in tandem with other like-minded people allowed for positive emotions and a strong sense of connection to one another (Boer et al. 2011; Dunlap 2009). These cumulative feelings of association, personal identity and positive emotions provided the backbone for the fans to participate at high levels for extended periods of time, and in many cases, decades (Fredrickson 2001).

Jun et al. (2012) stated that identity is the precursor to conative and affective behaviours based on attraction to an activity, the centrality of the activity to one's life and the benefits of social bonding that come with participation in the activity. For the fans who participated in this study, their former leisure affiliations were integral to their lives, both personally and socially, but of most importance, were essential to finding the leisure activity that was of paramount interest to their current sense of self. Without having been immersed in the music scenes surrounding the Dead or WP the fans may have never been turned on to the music of Jerry Joseph and the Jackmormons, and as many stated in their interviews, this thought would have been heart-wrenching due to the degree of importance they currently associate with their involvement. Having a lengthy personal history with music allowed the participants of this study to engage in growth through participation and consumption of music to refine tastes, build identity and develop life-long friendships that were integral to maintaining a high quality of life (Bennett 2013). That this occurred through a 'trial-and-error' process of exploration and personal evolution signals the importance of better understanding how leisurists make substitutions based on past experiences and transition through their leisure careers to cultivate the optimal level of enjoyment from their chosen activities (Walker, Hull, and Roggenbuck 1998). Just as important is understanding how the relationships that are formed through leisure participation aid in enhancing total experience, especially when there is a shared history of interests to serve as a strong foundation for a close-knit community of intimate friendships going forward (Harmon and Kyle 2016).

In writing about the many challenges of leisure half a century ago, Charles Brightbill (1960) elucidated the importance of the educational aspects of past leisure experiences:

One approach is to introduce the individual to new experiences without his discarding the old ones which have proven satisfying. In learning we look backward to the experiences that have been validated, we view the present to assess current relationships, and we look ahead trying to see how they will apply in the future. (97)

The concept of leisure substitutability would benefit from a revision and expansion in considering the trajectories of leisure careers which participants develop over a lifetime. By acknowledging the educational, social and identity properties associated with leisure activities, and how those connections evolve with the individual, scholars may be able to develop fuller understandings of the meanings associated with leisure participation, the evolution of those interests and the implications for prognosticating future interests or patterns of involvement.

## Notes

1. A fan who was an avid follower of the Grateful Dead.
2. The co-lead singer/guitarist for the Grateful Dead.

## Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

## Notes on contributors

**Justin Harmon** is an assistant professor in the Department of Community and Therapeutic Recreation at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro. His research interests include the use of music for identity maintenance, community formation and life course development. Additionally he studies how lifelong leisure associations are drawn on for coping and identity maintenance in people with cancer.

**Kyle M. Woosnam** is an associate professor in the Warnell School of Forestry and Natural Resources at the University of Georgia. His research interests include solidarity in tourist groups, residents in high-density tourism locations, and 'community members' and place attachment.

## References

- Arai, S. M., and A. M. Pedlar. 1997. "Building Communities Through Leisure: Citizen Participation in a healthy Communities Initiative." *Journal of Leisure Research* 29 (2): 167–182.
- Arai, S. M., and A. M. Pedlar. 2003. "Moving Beyond Individualism in Leisure Theory: A Critical Analysis of Concepts of Community and Social Engagement." *Leisure Studies* 22: 185–202.
- Baldwin, C. K., and P. A. Norris. 1999. "Exploring the Dimensions of Serious Leisure: 'Love Me-love My Dog'." *Journal of Leisure Research* 31 (1): 1–17.
- Beaumont, E., and D. H. K. Brown. 2015. "'Once a Local Surfer, Always a Local Surfer': Local Surfing Careers in a Southwest English Village." *Leisure Sciences* 37 (1): 68–86.
- Bennett, A. 2013. *Music, Style, and Aging: Growing Old Disgracefully?* Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- Boer, D., R. Fischer, M. Strack, M. H. Bond, E. Lo, and J. Lam. 2011. "How Shared Preferences in Music Create Bonds between People: Values as the Missing Link." *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 37 (9): 1159–1171.
- Brightbill, C. K. 1960. *The Challenge of Leisure*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Broström, A. W. 2016. "Learning to Lead: The Transition from Participant to Leader within the Swedish Scout Movement." *World Leisure Journal* 58 (1): 12–27.
- Brunson, M. W., and B. Shelby. 1993. "Recreation Substitutability: A Research Agenda." *Leisure Sciences* 15: 67–74.
- Camfield, L., and S. M. Skevington. 2008. "On Subjective Well-being and Quality of Life." *Journal of Health Psychology* 13 (6): 764–775.
- Charmaz, K. 2006. *Constructing Grounded Theory: A Practical Guide Through Qualitative Analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Clay, A. 2003. "Keepin' It Real: Black Youth, Hip-hop Culture, and Black Identity." *American Behavioral Scientist* 46 (10): 1346–1358.
- Creech, A., S. Hallam, H. McQueen, and M. Varvarigou. 2013. "The Power of Music in the Lives of Older Adults." *Research Studies in Music Education* 35 (1): 87–102.
- Creed, G. W., ed. 2006. *The Seductions of Community: Emancipations, Oppressions, Quandaries*. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press.
- Davis, J. R. 2006. "Growing Up Punk: Negotiating Aging Identity in a Local Music Scene." *Symbolic Interaction* 29 (1): 63–69.
- DeNora, T. 2000. *Music in Everyday Life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Diener, E., S. Oishi, and R. E. Lucas. 2011. "Subjective Well-being: The Science of Happiness and Life Satisfaction." In *The Oxford Handbook of Positive Psychology*, edited by S. J. Lopez, and C. R. Snyder, 2nd ed., 187–194. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ditton, R. B., D. K. Loomis, and S. Choi. 1992. "Recreation Specialization: Re-conceptualization from a Social Worlds Perspective." *Journal of Leisure Research* 24: 33–51.



- Ditton, R. B., and S. G. Sutton. 2004. "Substitutability in Recreational Fishing." *Human Dimensions of Wildlife* 9: 87–102.
- Dunlap, R. 2009. "Taking Aunt Kathy to Dinner: Family Dinner as a Focal Practice." *Leisure Sciences* 31: 417–433.
- Fredrickson, B. L. 1998. "What Good Are Positive Emotions?" *Review of General Psychology* 2 (3): 300–319.
- Fredrickson, B. L. 2001. "The Role of Positive Emotions in Positive Psychology: The Broaden-and-build Theory of Positive Emotions." *American Psychologist* 56 (3): 218–226.
- Glover, T. D., and W. Stewart. 2006. "Introduction to Special Issue: Rethinking Leisure and Community Research: Critical Reflections and Future Agendas." *Leisure/Loisir* 30 (2): 315–327.
- Harmon, J., and G. T. Kyle. 2016. "Community, Family and Leisure Immersion." *Leisure/Loisir* 40 (1): 79–100.
- Hendee, J. C., and R. W. Burdge. 1974. "The Substitutability Concept: Implications for Recreation Research and Management." *Journal of Leisure Research* 6: 157–162.
- Hollinger, D. A. 2006. "From Identity to Solidarity." *Daedalus* 135 (4): 23–31.
- Iso-Ahola, S. E. 1986. "A Theory of Substitutability of Leisure Behavior." *Leisure Sciences* 8 (4): 367–389.
- Jackson, E. L., and E. Dunn. 1988. "Integrating Ceasing Participation with Other Aspects of Leisure Behavior." *Journal of Leisure Research* 20: 31–45.
- Jun, J., G. T. Kyle, S. P. Vlachopoulos, N. D. Theodorakis, J. D. Absher, and W. E. Hammitt. 2012. "Reassessing the Structure of Enduring Leisure Involvement." *Leisure Sciences* 34: 1–18.
- Kuentzel, W. F., and T. A. Heberlein. 2006. "From Novice to Expert? A Panel Study of Specialization Progression and Change." *Journal of Leisure Research* 38 (4): 496–512.
- Kyle, G. T., and G. E. Chick. 2002. "The Social Nature of Leisure Involvement." *Journal of Leisure Research* 35: 426–448.
- Kyle, G. T., and G. E. Chick. 2004. "Enduring Leisure Involvement: The Importance of Personal Relationships." *Leisure Studies* 23: 243–266.
- Laiho, S. 2004. "The Psychological Functions of Music in Adolescence." *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy* 13 (1): 47–63.
- Lamont, M., M. Kennelly, and B. Moyle. 2014. "Costs and Perseverance in Serious Leisure Careers." *Leisure Sciences* 36: 144–160.
- Lewis, G. H. 1983. "The Meanings in the Music and the Music's in Me: Popular Music as Symbolic Communication." *Theory, Culture & Society* 1 (3): 133–141.
- Lloyd, K. M., and C. J. Auld. 2002. "The Role of Leisure in Determining Quality of Life: Issues of Content and Measurement." *Social Indicators Research* 57 (1): 43–71.
- McIntyre, N., and J. J. Pigram. 1992. "Recreation Specialization Reexamined: The Case of Vehicle-based Campers." *Leisure Sciences* 14: 3–15.
- Patton, M. 1990. *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Pedlar, A., and L. Haworth. 2006. "Community." In *A Handbook of Leisure Studies*, edited by C. Rojek, S. M. Shaw, and A. J. Veal, 518–532. London: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Perkins, R., and A. Williamon. 2014. "Learning to Make Music in Older Adulthood: A Mixed-methods Exploration of Impacts on Wellbeing." *Psychology of Music* 42 (4): 550–567.
- Rentfrow, P. J., J. A. McDonald, and J. A. Oldmeadow. 2009. "You Are What You Listen to: Young People's Stereotypes About Music Fans." *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations* 12 (3): 329–344.
- Ruud, E. 1997. "Music and the Quality of Life." *Nordic Journal of Music Therapy* 6 (2): 86–97.
- Saarikallio, S., and J. Erkkilä. 2007. "The Role of Music in Adolescents' Mood Regulation." *Psychology of Music* 35 (1): 88–109.
- Saldaña, J. 2012. *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Schäfer, T., and P. Sedlmeier. 2009. "From the Functions of Music to Music Preference." *Psychology of Music* 37 (3): 279–300.
- Schmidt, G. W., and G. L. Stein. 1991. "Sport Commitment: A Model Integrating Enjoyment, Dropout, and Burnout." *Journal of Sport and Exercise Psychology* 13 (3): 254–265.
- Scott, D. S., and G. Godbey. 1994. "Recreation Specialization in the Social World of Contract Bridge." *Journal of Leisure Research* 26 (3): 275–295.
- Searle, M. E. 1991. "Propositions for Testing Social Exchange Theory in the Context of Ceasing Leisure Participation." *Leisure Sciences* 13: 279–294.



- Stebbins, R. A. 2008. "Leisure Abandonment: Quitting Free-time Activity That We Love. LSA Newsletter 81." *Leisure Reflections* 19: 14–19.
- Stebbins, R. A. 2014. *Careers in Serious Leisure: From Dabbler to Devotee in Search of Fulfillment*. Houndmills: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Tracy, S. 2013. *Qualitative Research Methods: Collecting Evidence, Crafting Analysis, Communicating Impact*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Walker, G. J., R. B. Hull IV, and J. W. Roggenbuck. 1998. "On-site Optimal Experiences and Their Relationship to Off-site Benefits." *Journal of Leisure Research* 30: 453–471.